



Diploma Thesis Evaluation Form

Author: Jakob Kindl

Title: Conditions of Peace in the Context of the Colombian and Northern Irish Peace Process

Programme/year: Bezpečnostní studia, 2023

Author of Evaluation (supervisor): Tomáš Karásek

Criteria	Definition	Maximum	Points
Major Criteria			
	Research question, definition of objectives	10	8
	Theoretical/conceptual framework	30	28
	Methodology, analysis, argument	40	37
<i>Total</i>		80	73
Minor Criteria			
	Sources	10	9
	Style	5	4
	Formal requirements	5	4
<i>Total</i>		20	18
TOTAL		100	91



Evaluation

Major criteria:

The thesis focuses on peace agreements as a major topic in conflict/peace studies. By comparatively analyzing the Good Friday Agreement in Britain and the Peace Agreement in Colombia, the author deals with two major conceptual themes: the constitutive difference between positive and negative peace, and the importance of language as a medium of delivering the former, in either of the two varieties. Furthermore, the author's links the theoretical context with a special way of approving the peace agreements via referenda.

The author expertly outlines the theoretical framework of his analysis (though the initial "obligatory" mentions of realism and liberalism are, for the research purpose of the dissertation, rather superfluous). His understanding of the intricacies of all the theoretical approaches he covers is deep and complex. Even though, this reviewer would have appreciated more thorough references to academic literature, especially in the section devoted to the critique of Galtung's conceptualization of non-hierarchical relations between cultural, structural and direct violence which the author questions.

The analysis of the text (and context) of both peace agreement in question is thorough, detailed and persuasive. The author's conclusions concerning the reasons of the success and failure of the two agreements, respectively, are convincing and clearly following from the previous analysis.

That being said, after the – magisterially delivered – dissection of all the relevant factors, this reviewer is left unpersuaded as to the relevance of the language aspects of the peace agreements. A simple conclusion from the authors analysis seems to be that an (over)ambitious effort at a complex peace arrangement is not sustainable if it is not underpinned by an achievement of positive peace, i.e. the cessation of violence. In Northern Ireland, a ceasefire was achieved before the agreement was submitted to a referendum; in Colombia, the people were left wondering whether peace (even in the negative variety) would come at the very moment when they were asked to vote on the agreement. Put simply, the author's complex theoretical anchoring does not appear very convincing in answering one of the crucial questions. Or does it...?



**FACULTY
OF SOCIAL SCIENCES**
Charles University

Minor criteria:

The dissertation is written in a clear, fully adequate language. The analysis is based on appropriate and extensive selection of academic literature which the author references adequately.

Assessment of plagiarism:

The thesis does not exhibit traits of plagiarism.

Overall evaluation:

This is a mature dissertation that nicely interweaves the necessary theoretical, methodological and empirical elements. The aforementioned doubts concerning the relevance – or necessity – of the contribution of language theory to the explanation provided as the result of the analysis are rather a testament to the author's acumen than its absence.

Suggested grade:

A

Signature: