

Pré-rapport du mémoire de M2
Pre-report of the Master's thesis
Édition/Édition (2021—2023)

Étudiant(e)/Student :

Prénom, Nom / First Name, Family Name : Claudia Garcia Pereira de Oliveira
Titre du mémoire M2 / Title of the Master's thesis : Sintra in the Twentieth Century European Narratives: Otherness and Identity

Mobilité / Mobility :

Veillez souligner les établissements !/ Please, underline the institutions !
Eötvös Loránd Tudományegyetem, Budapest (ELTE)

École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales de Paris (EHESS)

Università degli Studi di Catania (UNICT)

Univerzita Karlova, Prague (CUNI)

Université Laval, Québec (UL)

Directeurs de recherche / Supervisors¹ :

Prénom, Nom / First Name, Family Name : Gábor Czoch
Titre /Title : Associate Professor
Université/University : ELTE

Évaluation/Evaluation:

Veillez consulter le tableau de conversion ci-dessous !/ Please, consult the grade conversion chart below !

Note dans l'établissement / Grade at the institution: B

Note dans le 2^{ème} établissement (ELTE) / Grade at the 2nd institution (ELTE): 4 good
(Note dans le 3^{ème} établissement / Evaluation – grade at the 3rd institution:)

Note TEMA+ / TEMA+ grade: Good

Pré-rapport / Pre-report :

max. 4500 caractères espaces inclus/max. 4500 characters including spaces

Ms. Claudia de Oliveira's thesis examines the different representations of one of Portugal's most famous tourist destinations, the city of Sintra near Lisbon, in the light of the various 20th

¹ Le pré-rapport est écrit par le 2^{ème} directeur (ou par le 2^{ème} et 3^{ème} directeurs) qui ne participe pas à la soutenance et inclut des questions à aborder lors de la soutenance./The pre-report is written by the 2nd supervisor (and in case the 3rd supervisor too), who does not personally take part in the defense and it includes questions to be addressed to the student during the thesis defense.

century narratives about it. Traditionally a favourite residence of the Portuguese royal family, Sintra owes its current fame in particular to the Romantic-style palaces built in the early 19th century and the surrounding parks. Sintra Cultural Landscape was inscribed on the UNESCO World Heritage List in 1995. More specifically, the author's aim is to explore the representation of this cultural landscape, which is the result of the interaction between man and nature, in international, national and local narratives (mainly literary texts and travel literature) and, as the title of the thesis suggests, in the light of identity and otherness.

The substantive analytical part of the thesis (104 pages in total) is 98 pages long, including 6 pages of bibliography. The text is supplemented by 15 figures, two tables and 252 footnotes. The bibliography is organised and the author has drawn on English, French and Portuguese literature. The references are accurate, but I note that in the case of Internet sources, the author only gives the url address and the title of the cited item is missing. The structure of the paper is clear and logical. The language of the text is clear, but there are sometimes disturbing repetitions. The author has divided her work into four chapters, but in fact the content is divided into two larger units. The first major part (chapters 1-3) can be seen as a detailed introduction to the subject. In a logical order, the author first presents the research questions, the theoretical and methodological basis of the thesis, and situates her work in the literature on the subject, noting that previous research lacks a comparison of Portuguese writers' texts on Sintra with travel literature, which means that the author's approach is novel in this respect (p.14 .) In this section, she presents the history of Sintra and the places (buildings, parks) that are prominent in the cultural landscape and, consequently, are also the protagonists of the various narratives about Sintra. This section concludes with a presentation of the sources on which the analysis is based.

The second major thematic unit (Chapter 4), which accounts for about half of the thesis, contains the actual analysis of the sources. Here, the author analyses the various representations of Sintra by the dominant themes of the narratives under study. These themes were identified on the basis of discourse analysis, and their identification can be seen as one of the results of the thesis. Another virtue of the thesis is that the author has also drawn on visual sources (postcards) in addition to the texts, and has incorporated these well into the analysis.

My main criticism of the work is that the final result leaves the reader with a sense of incompleteness. In Chapter 4, the author does a very good job of selecting really well chosen excerpt from the narratives under study, but often fails to analyse them in depth, and in the absence of this the reader is left with a description only. From the point of view of analysis, I find it problematic that the author treats the 20th century as an essentially homogeneous whole. It would have been worth paying more attention to the way in which the narrative of Sintra evolved over the course of the 20th century. Although not entirely absent from the analysis, the relationship between foreign and Portuguese accounts of Sintra is not systematically examined. It would also have been important for the author to have given a more detailed account of the social status, political and ideological orientation of the authors of the works analysed. Unfortunately, in the subchapter on the sources, the author discusses only the works and provides little information on the authors, which would be important for the interpretation of the representation, but the representations, from the point of view of the personal situation of their authors, are, if not completely ignored, hardly examined. Finally, I note that from Brubaker's study, which criticises the too frequent and too extensive use of identity, the author concludes that, although the criticism is justified, the use of the term cannot be avoided. But what would have been more important to draw from the study she cites is that we need to be more analytically precise about what we mean by identity, what we want to examine under this heading, for example, the practice or process of identification, self-representation, or external categorisation? Once again, the author has drawn on a considerable amount of sources, and the work has undeniable positive aspects, however, taking all this into account, the analysis could have been much more nuanced.

Questions :

Does the author see any major changes in the 20th century narratives about Sintra?

Does the author see any differences between Portuguese and foreign narratives?

Álvaro Solís

Budapest, 09.06. 2023

TEMA+ Grade conversion table

ELTE (Hungarian)	EHESS (French)	UNICT (Italian)	CUNI (Czech)	UL (Canadian)	Notes TEMA+
5	16-20 (pas de 19 et 20)	30 (A, Excellent)	A	95-100 (A+, 4,33) 90-94 (A, 4,00) 85-89 (A-, 3,67)	Très bien/Excellent
4	14-15	27-29 (B, Very Good)	B	80-84 (B+, 3,33) 75-79 (B, 3,00) 70-74 (B-, 2,67)	Bien/Good
3	12-13	23-26 (C, Good)	C	66-69 (C+, 2,33) 63-65 (C, 2,00) 60-62 (C-, 1,67)	Assez bien/ Amply sufficient
2	10-11	21-22 (D, Satisfactory) 18-20 (E, Sufficient)	D, E	55-59 (D+, 1,33) 50-54 (D, 1,00)	Passable/ Satisfactory/ Almost sufficient
1	0-9	1-17 (F, FX)	F	49 et moins (E, 0,00)	Insuffisant/ Insuficient